

# INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM POLICY NETWORK ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE MULTISTAKEHOLDER WORKING GROUP (MWG)

#### **WORKSHOP ON SUSTAINABLE GENERATIVE AI & AI GOVERNANCE**

## Meeting VII | 22 October 2024 at 11:00-12:30 UTC

#### **SUMMARY REPORT**

#### **Action items:**

- Written comments to draft Discussion Papers on Interoperability and Environment are welcome until 30.10. The two Sub-groups will finalize the draft Discussion Papers based on the feedback.
- The next PNAI MWG meeting will take place on 21.11. with focus on preparations for PNAI's session at the IGF Annual Meeting.
- The following PNAI MWG call will be held in December on 6.12.
- 1. The seventh online meeting in 2024 of the Policy Network on Artificial Intelligence (PNAI) Multistakeholder Working Group (MWG) took place on 22 October 2024 at 11:00 UTC.
- 2. The meeting was hosted by the MAG appointed facilitator of the PNAI and the IGF Secretariat's PNAI Consultant. The final version of the Agenda is attached to this document as Annex A1 and a list of meeting participants as Annex A2. The list of shared documents is annexed as A3.
- 3. The hosts opened the meeting and went through the agenda. The meeting was the second of two special PNAI Workshops where PNAI Sub-groups to present draft Discussion Papers the teams had prepared and give attendees an opportunity to share their comments and suggestions to guide finalization of the reports. The two Discussion Papers under review were sent to meeting attendees in advance and were added to meeting materials on PNAI website.
- 4. Shamira Ahmed presented the draft Discussion Paper 'Environmental Sustainability and the Generative AI Value Chain'. She provided an overview of the Sub-group's work in comparing Generative AI vs. traditional AI environmental impact and the selected approach of highlighting environmental impact for each stage of AI value chain. The draft Discussion Paper including analysis and recommendations is included in Annex 3.
- 5. Ivana Feldfeber representing DataGénero, an NGO based in Argentina, and The Gender and Environment Data Alliance GEDA shared about their work at the nexus of gender, AI, and the environment. The aim is to improve availability, accessibility, understanding and application of quality and robust data and information in the intersection of gender and environment. The focus is not only on women, adopting an intersectional point of view is vital.



- 6. Meeting attendees were welcomed to ask questions and comment on the Discussion Paper on Environmental Sustainability as well as Ivana Feldfeber's presentation. Attendees for example appreciated the value chain approach and emphasis on data, highlighted the importance of less energy hungry computational methods, the connection to internet governance, and proposed a scan of existing environmental policies toward Generative AI in different countries.
- 7. Chafic Chaya, Heramb Podar and Yik Chan Chin presented the draft Discussion Paper on 'AI Governance, Interoperability, and Good practices'. The team had explored AI activities, regulations, policies in different parts of the world, identified gaps as well as three key aspects for AI interoperability: Legal Frameworks, Technical Standards and Data & Privacy. The draft Discussion Paper including analysis and recommendations is included in Annex 3.
- 8. Meeting attendees were welcomed to ask questions and give comments to the Discussion Paper on AI Governance, Interoperability and Good practices. Attendees for example suggested looking into AI risks specifically, getting people to adhere to global interoperability standards, already existing use cases and governances that prioritize explainable AI that non-technical stakeholders understand.

## Other and next steps

- 9. The two Sub-groups were congratulated and thanked on their work in drafting the two Discussion Papers.
- 10. Written comments are welcome until 30.10.
- 11. The next step is for the Sub-groups to finalize their papers based on the input received.
- 12. The draft concept note for PNAI session at IGF 2024 Annual Meeting from September will be circulated again in meeting materials. Everyone is encouraged to add suggestions for speakers.
- 13. The next PNAI MWG meetings will take place on 21.11. and 6.12. The main focus of the next meeting will be speaker selection and preparations for PNAI's session at the IGF Annual meeting in December.
- 14. A meeting summary, materials and presentations will be shared through the PNAI mailing list.
- 15. Please share your questions and suggestions with Maikki Sipinen (maikki.sipinen@un.org).



### **ANNEX A1**

# AGENDA, PNAI Multistakeholder Working Group Meeting VI

# 1. Opening

Opening the meeting and updates on latest developments

- Audace Niyonkuru and Amrita Choudhury, PNAI Facilitators

## 2. Environmental Sustainability and the Generative AI Value Chain

PNAI Sub-Group has prepared a Discussion Paper on Environmental sustainability and Generative AI. Team leaders will present highlights of their findings and recommendations.

Workshop participants are welcome to share their suggestions, views and feedback with the drafting team. Attendees are encouraged to read the draft Discussion Paper in advance.

#### Presentation

- Shamira Ahmed and Mohd Asyraf Zulkifley, PNAI team leaders

Discussion, feedback and questions

# 3. AI Governance, interoperability and good practices

PNAI Sub-Group has prepared a Discussion Paper on interoperability in AI governance. Team leaders will present highlights of their findings and recommendations.

Workshop participants are welcome to share their suggestions, views and feedback with the drafting team. Attendees are encouraged to read the draft Discussion Paper in advance.

#### Presentation

- Yik Chan Chin, Chafic Chaya, Sergio Mayo & Amado Espinosa, PNAI team leaders

Discussion, feedback and questions

- 4. Next steps
- 5. Closing and any other business

#### **ANNEX A2**

**MEETING PARTICIPANTS** (in alphabetical order<sup>1</sup>):

- 1. Shamira Ahmed
- 2. Muriel Alapini
- 3. Kossi Amessinou
- 4. Shadrach Ankrah
- 5. Kwaku Antwi
- 6. D Arantes
- 7. Sarah Aryee

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Names indicated as participants identified in the Zoom online participation tool



- 8. María Arzamendia
- 9. Francis Bahene
- 10. Patrick Bell
- 11. Patricia Boshe
- 12. Zeina Bou Harb
- 13. Hanane Boujemi
- 14. Yik Chan Chin
- 15. Chafic Chaya
- 16. Amrita Choudhury
- 17. Shirani De Clercq
- 18. Avri Doria
- 19. Suzanne Elhorr
- 20. Omor Faruque
- 21. Ivana Feldfeber
- 22. Caroline Friedman Levy
- 23. Washington Jiang
- 24. Firdaus K
- 25. Nancy Kanasa
- 26. Ibiso Kingsley-George
- 27. Jasmine Ko
- 28. Joly MacFie
- 29. Vinutha Magal Shreenath
- 30. Faris Mubarek
- 31. Nuraini Naim
- 32. Fridah Naliaka
- 33. Doreen Nandutu Nabuzale
- 34. Audace Niyonkuru
- 35. Daniel Nkuzuwalela
- 36. Emmy Okwir Ogule
- 37. June Parris
- 38. Heramb Podar
- 39. Salomon Prosper Victoire Pounika
- 40. Carol Roach
- 41. Ibrahima Sadio
- 42. Charles Shaban
- 43. Maikki Sipinen
- 44. Elves Teles
- 45. Julian Theseira
- 46. Saba Tiku
- 47. Lufuno Tshikalange
- 48. Lang Wang
- 49. Tania Zaroubi
- 50. Mohd Asyraf Zulkifley



#### **ANNEX A3**

# **SHARED DOCUMENTS**

Meeting presentation

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot\_download/282/28291

Environmental Sustainability and the Generative AI Value Chain

Draft version of the Discussion paper

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot\_download/282/28234

Presentation

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot\_download/282/28289

Link to leave written comments (by 30.10.)

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1pgpvfiLmEjL1V\_1GFeUzVzdOrhiafSFQ/edit?usp=sharing&ouid=108329483782187102787&rtpof=true&sd=true

AI Governance, Interoperability, and Good practices

Draft version of the Discussion Paper

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot\_download/282/28235

Presentation

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot\_download/282/28290

Link to leave written comments (by 30.10.)

 $\frac{https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Amh3S711ZFXtmqA4JExHXiVLlCkliK4Q/edit?usp=s}{haring\&ouid=108329483782187102787\&rtpof=true\&sd=true}$ 

Concept note: PNAI session for IGF 2024 Annual Meeting

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1y90vt07mm3sR6-6eV4pUFVELfYeEEWu6zM7cQ[alw]Y/edit?pli=1

<u>Link to meeting recording</u> Passcode: .LD\$+3AS The recording is available for one month.