



**INTERNET GOVERNANCE FORUM
POLICY NETWORK ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE
MULTISTAKEHOLDER WORKING GROUP
WORKSHOP ON INCENTIVIZING ACCOUNTABILITY THROUGH AI LIABILITY
& AI LABOUR ISSUES**

Meeting VI | 10 October 2024 at 14:00-15:30 UTC

SUMMARY REPORT

Action items:

- Written comments to draft Discussion Papers on Liability and Labour are welcome until 17.10. Next, the Sub-groups will finalize draft Discussion Papers based on the feedback.
- The next PNAI Workshop will take place on 10.10. and 22.10. Registration will open shortly.
- The following PNAI MWG 2024 calls are planned for 21.11. and 6.12.
- Everyone will share speaker ideas for PNAI's session at IGF 2024 Annual meeting.

1. The sixth online meeting in 2024 of the Policy Network on Artificial Intelligence (PNAI) Multistakeholder Working Group (MWG) took place on 10 October 2024 at 14:00 UTC.
2. The meeting was hosted by the MAG appointed facilitator of the PNAI and the IGF Secretariat's PNAI Consultant. The final version of the Agenda is attached to this document as Annex A1 and a list of meeting participants as Annex A2. The list of shared documents is annexed as A3.
3. The hosts opened the meeting and explained the agenda. The meeting was first of two special PNAI Workshops where the main goal was for PNAI Sub-groups to present the draft Discussion Papers the teams had prepared and give attendees an opportunity to give comments and suggestions to guide finalization of the reports. The two Discussion Papers were sent to meeting attendees in advance and added to meeting materials on PNAI website.
4. Caroline Friedman presented the draft Discussion Paper 'Liability for Harms Across the AI Lifecycle: Incentivizing Accountability' that was drafted by PNAI Sub-group on Liability as a mechanism for supporting AI accountability. One of the key principles guiding regulatory approaches to AI is accountability, it needs to be clear who is responsible when an AI system causes damage. The international AI Governance community has done little to answer questions of accountability. The draft Discussion Paper including analysis and recommendations is included in Annex 3.
5. Gabriel Weil, a legal scholar at Touro Law School presented his research on liability as a tool to mitigate AI risk. Punitive damages (damages above the harm suffered by the plaintiff) could be

used to internalize uninsurable risks brought by AI and aligning incentives of the developers and deployers of these systems with the broader society.

6. Meeting attendees were welcomed to ask questions and give comments to the Discussion Paper on Liability and Gabriel Weil on his research. The attendees asked about best practices for the Global South countries; liability for State actors and state actor deployed systems; and; suggested focusing more on operationalizing the general frameworks on liability as well as the idea on punitive damages.
7. Olga Cavalli presented the draft Discussion Paper on Labour issues in AI. The paper was drafted by PNAI Sub-group on Labor issues throughout AI's life cycle. The team had observed challenges (for example job substitution), and opportunities (for example AI supporting inclusion of previously excluded population into the workforce) related to AI and Labour, analyzed the role of unions and the current AI regulation in labour market. The draft Discussion Paper including analysis and recommendations is included in Annex 3.
8. Meeting attendees were welcomed to ask questions and give comments to the Discussion Paper on Labour issues in AI. The suggestions included for example increasing emphasis on job quality; deterioration in work quality brought by increased dealing with machines instead of human managers; unions role in participatory design on technology in the workplace; discriminatory hiring practices; and; transition for workers who lose their jobs.

Other and next steps

9. The two Sub-groups were congratulated and thanked on their work in drafting the two Discussion Papers.
10. Written comments are welcome for a week following the Workshop until 17.10.
11. The next step is for the Sub-groups to finalize their papers based on the input received.
12. The draft concept note for PNAI session at IGF 2024 Annual Meeting from September will be circulated again in meeting materials. Everyone is encouraged to add suggestions for speakers.
13. The next Workshop and discussion on the two remaining Discussion Papers will take place on 22.10. and the following PNAI MWG meetings will take place on 21.11. and 6.12.
14. A meeting summary, materials and presentations will be shared through the PNAI mailing list.
15. Please share your questions and suggestions with Maikki Sipinen (maikki.sipinen@un.org).

ANNEX A1

AGENDA, PNAI Multistakeholder Working Group Meeting VI

1. Opening

Opening the meeting and goals of the workshop

– Audace Niyonkuru and Amrita Choudhury, PNAI Facilitators

2. Liability for Harms Across the AI Lifecycle: Incentivizing Accountability

PNAI Sub-Group has prepared a Discussion Paper on AI Liability. Team leaders will present highlights of their findings and recommendations.

Workshop participants are welcome to share their suggestions, views and feedback with the drafting team. Attendees are encouraged to read the draft Discussion Paper in advance.

Presentation

– Caroline Friedman Levy and Umut Pajaro Velasquez

Discussion, feedback and questions

3. Labour issues throughout AI's life cycle

PNAI Sub-Group has prepared a Discussion Paper on Labour issues in AI. Team leaders will present highlights of their findings and recommendations.

Workshop participants are welcome to share their suggestions, views and feedback with the drafting team. Attendees are encouraged to read the draft Discussion Paper in advance.

Presentation

– Germán López and Olga Cavalli

Discussion, feedback and questions

4. Next steps

5. Closing and any other business

ANNEX A2

MEETING PARTICIPANTS (in alphabetical order¹):

1. Frank Anati
2. Abdoul Aziz Issaka
3. Patrick Bell
4. Janine Berg
5. Titti Cassa
6. Olga Cavalli
7. Chafic Chaya
8. YingChu Chen

¹ Names indicated as participants identified in the Zoom online participation tool

9. Gabriel Delsol
10. Lika Døhl Diouf
11. Hasrul Eka Putra Kau
12. amado espinosa
13. Aji Fama Jobe
14. Omor Faruque
15. Josephine Fosua
16. Caroline Friedman Levy
17. Sameer Gahlot
18. Juliana Harsianti
19. Judith Hellerstein
20. Poncelet Ileleji
21. Manal Ismail
22. Washington Jiang
23. Sonam Jindal
24. Jasmine Ko
25. Peter Koch
26. Ansgar Koene
27. Godsway Kubi
28. Lord Ravinder Kumar Sharma
29. Martina Le Gall Malakova
30. Germán López
31. Ramyaa M
32. Vinutha Magal Shreenath
33. Med Mehdi Dib
34. Ramzy Muliawan
35. Nuraini Naim
36. Doreen Nandutu Nabuzale
37. Audace Niyonkuru
38. Emmy Okwir Ogule
39. Umut Pajaro Velasquez
40. June Parris
41. Heramb Podar
42. Shantanu Prabhat
43. Delfi Ramirez
44. Mohamed Saïd Ahetan
45. Azeem Sajjad
46. Shinji Sato
47. Maikki Sipinen
48. Ibrahim Soro
49. Antara Vats
50. Sher Verick
51. Gabriel Weil

- 52. Linfeng Xie
- 53. Sabelo Zimu
- 54. Sonali Zol

ANNEX A3

SHARED DOCUMENTS

Meeting presentation

https://intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/282/28285

Liability for Harms Across the AI Lifecycle: Incentivizing Accountability

Draft version of the Discussion paper

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/282/28177

Research paper by Gabriel Weil: Tort Law as a Tool for Mitigating Catastrophic Risk from Artificial Intelligence

https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=4694006

Article in Noema: Your AI Breaks it? You Buy it

<https://www.noemamag.com/your-ai-breaks-it-you-buy-it/>

Link to leave written comments (by 17.10.)

<https://intgovforum.org/en/content/pnai-multistakeholder-working-group>

Labour issues in AI

Draft version of the Discussion Paper

https://www.intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/282/28178

Presentation: Labour issues in AI

https://intgovforum.org/en/filedepot_download/282/28286

Concept note: PNAI session for IGF 2024 Annual Meeting

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1y90vt07mm3sR6-6eV4pUFVELfYeEEWu6zM7cQJalwJY/edit?pli=1>

Link to leave written comments (by 17.10.)

<https://intgovforum.org/en/content/pnai-multistakeholder-working-group>

[Link to meeting recording](#) Passcode: Y49@?Z=U The recording is available for one month.